

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Chapter 1: Framing the Principles	4
The Law of Waters Has Many Aspects	4
Section 1: Watercourses Defined	7
Riparian/Littoral Tract Defined	8
Meander Lines	9
Is the Subject Tract Riparian?	10
Tidelands	11
Lake Defined	13
Lake vs. Surface Flow	14
Lake vs. River	14
Local Terms	15
Section 2: Categories of Waters	16
Categories of Disputes	17
Stability Required for Riparian/Littoral Titles	18
Consequences of New Systems	21
Section 3: ‘Navigable’ Has Many Definitions	22
Regulatory Limits in Federal Law	24
Federal Regulation—Artificial Lake in Two States	26
Relevant Definition—Property Titles	27
Relevant Definition—Right to Navigate.....	28
Private Titles to Navigable Riverbeds are Qualified.....	28
Section 4: Navigability, Intent & Perception	29
Intent & Riparian Land Descriptions	30
Strip & Gore Doctrine (Centerline Presumption).....	32
Strip & Gore Doctrine—State Boundary Exceptions.....	33
Section 5: Precedent from Many Sources	34
English Precedent—De Jure Maris.....	35
Pennsylvania—Exception.....	36
Dutch Grants.....	36
Spanish Precedent—Las Siete Partidas	37
Process to Affirm Spanish Grants	38

French Antecedents.....	38
International Treaty Lines.....	41
The Equal Footing Doctrine	43
Northwest Territory.....	44
Federal vs. State Grants.....	45
Submerged Lands Act	45
Swamplands Act of 1850	46
Chapter 2: The Public Trust Doctrine.....	47
The “Big Three”—Public Trust Doctrine	48
1: Martin v. Waddell	48
2: Illinois Central Railroad v. Illinois	49
3: Shively v. Bowlby	50
Some Decisions Left to the States	51
Public Trust & Mexican Land Grants.....	51
Public Trust vs. Natural State.....	52
Questionable Applications of the Public Trust Doctrine.....	52
Wisconsin—Public Trust Doctrine vs. Prosperity.....	55
State Powers vs. Takings Clause	57
Self-Serving Statements & Public Trust Doctrine	58
Maryland—Balanced View	58
Other Methods of Government Acquisition of Land	59
Public Trust Doctrine—Summary	61
Chapter 3: Defining & Locating the Water Line.....	63
Section 1: Tidal Shoreline—High-Water Mark	64
Confusion over High-Water Mark.....	66
Measuring Mean High-Water Mark.....	67
Tidal Shoreline—High-Water Mark Variations	69
New York—Limited Exception	69
Louisiana.....	70
West Coast United States	70
Hawai’i.....	71
1-A: Tidal Shoreline—Low-Water Mark Exceptions	74
Massachusetts—Low-water Mark.....	75
Delaware—Low-water Mark	76
Virginia—Low-water Mark.....	76

Section 2: Non-Tidal Water Line—General	77
The Vegetation Test.....	78
Soils Test	78
Alternate Test—Leaf & Twig Litter	79
Louisiana—River vs. Lake Disputes.....	79
Section 3: Major Inland Rivers—Non-Tidal	81
3-A: Inland Navigable Rivers—High Water Mark	81
Louisiana—Conflicting Definitions of “High-Water”	85
3-B: Inland Navigable Rivers—Low Water Mark	86
Section 4: Doctrine of the Thalweg vs. Midline.....	87
Thalweg & State Boundaries—Navigable Rivers	88
Thalweg is the Downstream Line.....	90
Thalweg Exceptions	91
No Thalweg Without Line of Navigation.....	92
No Thalweg Without a Distinct Channel.....	93
Section 5: Non-Navigable Rivers	95
Non-Navigable Rivers—Midline Between the Banks.....	95
Early Midline Cases Consistent.....	96
Later Rulings—Fragmented Standards	98
Thread of Non-navigable River—Alternate Theory	101
Section 6: Lakes—Contour vs. Water Mark	102
Great Lakes—High-Water Mark Issues.....	102
Contour as Boundary Line	103
Contour Line—Natural Navigable Lake:.....	103
Contour Line—Artificial Lakes	105
Tennessee—Contour vs. Unidentified Iron Rods.....	106
Florida—Benchmark Data.....	107
Section 7: Meander Lines—Varying Significance	109
Meander Line—Evidence of Navigability.....	110
Meander Lines—Northwest Territory	111
Alaska—Recent Meander Line.....	112
Exceptions—Where Meander Line May Control Title	113
Specific Exception—Vague Water Boundaries	113
Louisiana—Meander Lines	114
Meander Lines—Summary	116

Chapter 4: Stable Rights—Changing Features 117

Section 1: Accretion, Erosion & Avulsion 117

Erosion & Accretion—Rate of Change 119
“Gradual and Insensible”—or “Identifiable” 119
Accretion Across a Section Line 120
Variants of Accretion Rule 121
Typical Avulsion 123
Avulsion & Public Trust Doctrine 124
Oxbow Lakes 125
Avulsion of Thalweg Within the River 127
Reliction 128
Shoreline—Reliction & Glacio-isostatic Uplift 128

Section 2: Island Formation—Navigable Waters 129

Evaluation by Surveyor vs. Property Title 131
Channel Abandonment vs. Altered Water Volume 131
Island vs. Meander Line—Sandbar Near Shore 132
Island—Existing at Statehood 134
Island—State Boundary Lines—Exceptions 134
Island—Non-navigable River 135

Section 3: Complete/Partial Submergence of a Tract 135

Re-Emergence of a Tract—Two Theories 136
Theory A—Re-emergence of Submerged Tract 137
Theory B—Re-Emergence to Existing Lines 138
Partial Submergence/Re-Emergence 141

Section 4: Artificial Avulsions 144

Types of Artificial Avulsions 144
Iowa—Channeled River 145
Colorado River Re-Channeled 146
Excavation of Upland—Artificial Avulsion 148
Limited Exceptions—Riparian Rights on Canal 150
North Carolina—Minority Rule 150

Section 5: Variants of Artificial Accretion 152

Artificial Accretion by Remote Structures 152
Iowa—Artificial Fill by a Municipality 154
Permanent Reduction of River—Dam Construction 155
Artificial Accretion—Aid to Navigation 156
Maryland—Artificial Fill on Tidal River 157
Not All Artificial Fill Attaches to Upland 159

Section 6: Artificial Monuments & Water Boundaries	160
Call for the Mouth of a River	162
Priority of Calls—Non-navigable Lakes & Rivers.....	164
Monuments on River Banks.....	167
Reference to a Distant River	168
Call for River—Location is Conjecture	169
Chapter 5: Constitutional Issues, Legislation.....	171
Section 1: Subsequent Legislation	171
Re-Defining Navigability	174
River as Public Highway by Legislation	175
Pennsylvania—Subsequent Legislation as Evidence.....	176
Transfer to States by Legislative Act.....	178
Section 2: US Army Corps of Engineers (U.S.A.C.E.)	179
U.S.A.C.E.—Government Project vs. Title.....	182
Section 3: Bulkhead & Pierhead Lines	183
Harbor Lines Can Be Re-Defined.....	184
Permanent Fill May Terminate Public Interest.....	186
1899 Act vs. Existing Rights	187
1899 Act vs. Legislative Grant.....	188
New Jersey—Conveyance to Bulkhead/Pierhead Line	188
Limits to Scope of 1899 Act	190
Section 4: Common Law Fill of Coastline	191
Connecticut—Bulkheads to ‘Hold Back the Sea’	191
Maryland—Legislative Authority to Fill	193
Other Views—Fill of State Land.....	193
Section 5: Regulation & Takings Clause	194
Takings Clause in State Courts.....	196
Hawai’i—Takings Clause & Ocean Accretion.....	198
Chapter 6: Incidental Rights	200
Section 1: Origins of Incidental Rights	200
List of Incidental rights	201
Right to Reasonable Water Use.....	202
Right to Remain Riparian	202
Challenges to the Law of Accretion	204
Right to Build a Pier	205
Washington Exception.....	205

Section 2: Apportioning Rights & Accretions	206
Apportioning is Not Always Appropriate	207
General Methods of Apportioning.....	207
Connecticut—Cove Method for Wharf Lines.....	210
Wharf Lines Within Private Lake.....	211
Wisconsin—Statutory Wharf Lines.....	212
Apportioning Accretions in Small Lakes.....	214
Louisiana—Accretion Apportioned by Acreage	215
Apportioning Accretion Across a Stream.....	217
Section 3: Dockominiums.....	219
Dockominiums, Incidental Rights & Title	220
Dockominium vs. Public Trust Doctrine.....	221
Michigan—Subdivision on Small Lake	222
Dockominiums: Section 10 Permits	223
Jones Act—Navigable Ship vs. Floating Building.....	224
Land Surveyors & Dockominium Projects.....	225
Chapter 7: Differentiating Types of Rivers	227
Rivers—Overview	227
Navigation is of Critical Importance	228
Section 1: Categories of Rivers	228
North Carolina—Several Categories	230
Technical vs. Popular Navigability	232
Kentucky Rivers—Navigable in Fact	234
Proving Extent of the Public Trust Doctrine	235
Texas—Specific Dimensions	236
Mississippi—Calculations Limit Right to Navigate	237
Northwest Territory—Unusual Background	237
Section 2: Early Decisions—Inland Rivers	239
Lunar Tide Test vs. Civil Law Test.....	239
Indiana—Lunar Tide Test.....	240
Civil Law Test—Fall Line Test	240
Connecticut—The Fall Line vs. Tide Test	241
North Carolina & Tennessee—Civil Law Test.....	242
Section 3: Title—Major Inland Rivers	243
Private Titles Under the Ohio River	243
New York—Hudson & Mohawk Rivers	244
Utah—Five River Segments Categorized	245

Section 4: Above the Fall Line—Right of Navigation	246
Adjoiners Private Right of Access	246
Limited Navigation Sufficient.....	247
Section 5: Log-Floating Test, Floatable Rivers	248
Single Log Floating Sufficient—State Examples	248
Floating Single Logs—Marginal Examples	250
Rafted Logs	251
Floating Logs vs. Regulatory Limits	252
North Carolina—Floatable Rivers	253
Proving Right to Navigate—Varied Criteria	254
Mississippi—Right to Navigate Quantified	255
Section 6: Portage—General	256
Common Law Right to Portage.....	257
Portage—Effect on Right to Navigate.....	258
Portage—Effect on State Title	260
Portage—Significance to Admiralty Law	260
Portage—Significance Under Federal Power Act	261
Section 7: Extent of the Right to Navigate	263
Extent of the Public Highway.....	264
Alaska—Constitutional Right to Navigate.....	265
Regulating Dams to Promote Fish Migration.....	265
<i>Chapter 8: Rivers & the U.S. Supreme Court</i>	<i>266</i>
Section 1: Limits of Regulatory Authority	266
1: Propellor Genesee Chief	267
2: The Daniel Ball	268
3: The Montello	269
United States v. Appalachian Electric Power Co.....	271
Tennessee—Regulatory Standards Appropriate	272
Section 2: Regulatory vs. Title Standards.....	272
1: PPL Montana LLC v. Montana	273
2: State of North Carolina v. ALCOA.....	275
Section 3: Texas Standard—Gradient Boundaries.....	278
Section 4: U.S. v. Rio Grande Dam & Irrigation	281

Chapter 9: The Great Lakes	283
The Illinois—Ohio Standard	284
Indiana—Conflicting Standards	286
Michigan	288
Wisconsin.....	290
New York—Pennsylvania.....	291
 Chapter 10: Other Large Natural Lakes.....	 293
Great Salt Lake—Utah	294
Devils Lake—North Dakota.....	297
Lake Champlain—Vermont & New York.....	298
Finger Lakes Region—New York	299
Lake of the Woods—Minnesota	302
Lake Coeur d’Alene—Idaho	303
Lake Okeechobee—Florida.....	304
 Summary: Large Natural Lakes	 305
 Chapter 11: Smaller Natural Lakes & Ponds.....	 306
Conflicting Standards for Ponds & Small Lakes	306
 Section 1: Three Rulings on Wolf Lake—Illinois	 310
1: Hardin v. Jordan—Benchmark for Meander Lines.....	310
2: Mitchell v. Smale—Bait & Switch.....	314
3: Hardin v. Shedd—Senior Title	315
Section Lines Within Lake	317
 Section 2: Great Ponds—Massachusetts & Maine	 318
Great Ponds—New Hampshire.....	319
Ordinance of 1641/1647 Limited to Eastern States	320
 Section 3: Limits of Strip & Gore Doctrine—Lakes	 321
Pennsylvania—Limited Rights of Adjoiners	321
New York & Connecticut.....	322
Minnesota—Division of a Drained Lake	323
Intent, Area & Smaller Lakes	326
 Section 4: Lake Navigation—Civil vs. Common Law	 331
Right to Navigate—Common Law Standard	331
Right to Navigate—Civil Law Standard	333

Section 5: Private Lake vs. Legislation	334
Indiana—Lake Preservation Act.....	335
Chapter 12: Artificial vs. Natural Lakes.....	337
Section 1: Artificial Lakes—Different Standards	338
Incidental Rights—Artificial Lake	339
Intermediate Shore Zones—Artificial Lakes	341
Washington—Contour & Retracement on Lake	343
North Dakota—Lake Sakakawea	344
Tennessee—Limited Littoral Rights	345
New Mexico—Conchas Lake & Spanish Law	345
Wisconsin—Minority Position	347
Privately-Owned Reservoirs as Appurtenance	348
North Carolina—Private Lakes.....	349
Section 2: Natural Lake Enhanced	350
Canal between Tidal basin & Freshwater Lake	350
Lake Level Permanently Raised	353
Washington—Lake Chelan.....	355
Sufficient Evidence—Original Contour	359
California—Clear Lake	360
California—Lake Tahoe.....	362
California—Clear Lake & Lake Tahoe—Contrast	363
Idaho—Two Separate High-Water Lines	364
Indiana—Artificial Origins Ignored	365
Enhanced Lake—Natural Characteristics.....	365
Summary—Enhanced Natural Lakes	367
Chapter 13: Unusual Problems & Standards	368
Section 1: Destruction of Lakes	368
Wisconsin—Intentional Destruction of a Lake	368
Minnesota—Pond Drained by Artificial Channel	369
California—Mono Lake	371
North Carolina—Lake Mattamuskeet.....	372
Section 2: New Waters Covering Private Land	373
New Madrid Earthquake of 1811/1812.....	373
Reelfoot Lake—Existing Colonial Grants.....	373
Big Lake—Little River	375
Lake or Swamp?.....	376

Lake or River?	377
South Dakota—Water Ponding on Private Land.....	378
Washington—Sloughs, Bays & Rivers Defined	381
Texas—Laguna Madre	384
Section 3: Prescription and Water.....	387
General Considerations	387
Prescriptive Claim on Private Lake	389
Right to Navigate by Prescription	390
Arkansas—Prescription Based on Inundation	390
Adverse use in Non-navigable River	391
Connecticut—Prescriptive Right to Reservoir	391
Section 4: Mineral Estate—Riparian Boundary.....	391
Section 5: Subsurface Water & Geothermal Energy.....	393
Rule of Capture—British Rule	394
Subsurface Water is Not a Mineral.....	395
Geothermal Energy.....	396
Section 6: Mill Rights	397
Mill Rights & Practical Location	399
Mill Rights Implied by Prior Use.....	400
Connecticut—Non-navigable Mill Ponds.....	401
Chapter 14: Surface Flow & Water Allocation.....	406
Surface Flow vs. Stream.....	406
Section 1: Surface Flow—Three Theories	407
1: Common Enemy Doctrine.....	408
2: Civil Law Rule—Natural Easement.....	409
3: Reasonable Use Doctrine.....	410
Modification of the Doctrines.....	412
Recent Shift to the Reasonable Use Doctrine.....	413
Field Analysis to Confirm Surface Flow.....	414
Legal Drains, Managed Drainage	416
Section 2: Water Use—Three Theories.....	417
Natural Flow, Reasonable Use Theories	417
Artificial Increase in Stream Flow	419
Prior Appropriations & Federal Rights.....	420

Chapter 15: Beaches—Above Mean High-Water	422
Section 1: Easement vs. General Public Right	422
Georgia—Dedicated Easement Along Shore	424
Delaware—Easement Along Lakeshore.....	424
‘Moveable’ Inland Boundary of Beach Parcel?	428
Texas—Open Beaches Act	430
Florida & Beachfront Replenishment	432
Prescriptive Claim—Private Beach	434
Section 2: Beach Rights by Custom.....	435
Texas & Florida—Custom Recognized	436
Cases Critical of Custom	437
Scalia Dissent—Cannon Beach	438
California—Recent Rulings	439
Hawai’i—Unique History of Beach Rights.....	443
Maine—Almeder v. Kennebunkport.....	444
Chapter 16: Limited Rights in Submerged Areas	446
Lease vs. Right in Property.....	447
Georgia—Oyster Beds	448
New Jersey—Patchwork of Filled Areas	450
Mississippi—Fill of Oyster Shells.....	451
In Closing.....	453
Glossary of Terms:	455
Index.....	474